

# ליקוטי ופסקי הלכות "חוקי חיים"

ותלמדם  
"חוקי חיים"  
לעשות רצונך  
בלבב שלם



שע"י "חדר הוראה" שבונת מנחת יצחק פיעה"ק ירושלם תובב"א - בראשות הרב חיים אהרן בלייער שליט"א

Halochos compiled by HaRav Chaim Bleier – Translated from the Hebrew edition by R' Zerachya Shicker

Please do not  
read during  
Davening or  
Krias Hatorah

## The Mitzvah of Sukkah

# 151

### Maamid with Schach

#### Maamid

1. The Rishonim argue whether schach may be placed on something that is unfit for schach. In other words, may it be set down or supported on something that can become tamei, e.g., metal, in such a way that if that thing weren't there, the schach would fall? This is called the pesul of "maamid" (ראשונים סוכה כ"א). Some say it is assur out of concern someone will think that just like that material may be used to support schach, it may also be used as the schach itself (הר"ן והריטב"א).
2. Others hold that there is no issur whatsoever to place schach on something that cannot be used for schach itself (רא"ש, תרומת הדשן צ"א).
3. **Practical halachah.** As far as the halachah, the poskim hold that one should lechatchilah not place schach on something pasul. Bedieved, or if there is nothing else to put the schach on, one may be meikel (מג"א, תרכ"ט סק"ט, ח"א כלל קמ"ו ס"ל, שו"ע הרב תרכ"ט ס"ג, מ"ב שם סקכ"ב).
4. **Examples of bedieved.** If one already built his sukkah and placed his schach on something that can become tamei, he does not need to dismantle it (שו"ע הרב ס"ג). It could be this is only if fixing it is difficult or a big hassle (מ"ר בעל שבת הקהתי). Similarly, if one ate on the first night of Sukkos in a sukkah whose schach was placed on something that can become tamei, he does not need to eat again in another sukkah (חזו"א, ארחות רבינו ח"ב עני ר"ח). Also, if one went to his in-laws and their schach was placed on something unfit to be used as schach, he may eat there (הלכות חג בוג, הגר"י קרליץ, חוט שני סוכות עני ר"ט) (פ"ז ס"א הע"ל 2).
5. **Awning on aluminum tracks.** If one has a balcony covered by an awning that is on aluminum tracks and he removed the awning to make a sukkah, he should not place the schach directly on the tracks since they cannot be used as schach. Instead he should place wooden beams perpendicularly over the tracks and put the schach on the beams (בית דוד פ"ו הערה 3).
6. **Iron beams.** If someone has an area for his sukkah that has iron beams, e.g., a balcony that has an iron beam every meter, or if someone wants to support a schach mat with iron wires attached to the walls on either side, lechatchilah he should not put the schach on the iron itself. Instead, he should place wooden beams perpendicularly on the iron beams or wires and put the schach on the wooden beams.

#### On a Stone Wall

7. Even though stone may not be used as schach, it is not a problem of maamid to lay schach down on a stone wall. This is because it is unusual to make a stone roof – thus, there is no concern people will think stone may be used for schach (מ"ב סי' תרכ"ט סקכ"ב). Even according to the Chazon Ish, who is machmir on "maamid demaamid" (below, 11), one would be able to place schach on a stone wall that has iron reinforcement rods inside the wall since the iron is not visible and is only there to strengthen the wall (חזו"א סי' קמ"ג סק"ב ד"ה ולסמוך).

#### On Something Pasul Derabanan

8. Most poskim hold that one may lechatchilah place schach on something that is only pasul derabanan for schach. Since the whole issur of maamid is a gezeirah and a lechatchilah, Chazal did not extend the gezeirah to something that is only pasul derabanan (ביה"ל, תר"ל ד"ה כל, שו"ע הרב ס"ג, חזו"א סי' נ"ה, הגר"י קרליץ, חוט שני סוכות עני ר"א).

9. **Placing schach on walls.** In light of this, the Pri Megadim (א"א סק"א) is unsure whether one may place schach directly on top of the sukkah walls if they are wooden panels wider than four tefachim: since miderabanan they cannot be used as schach (שו"ע סי' תרכ"ט), putting schach on top of them is maamid on something that is pasul miderabanan as schach.
10. However, since most poskim are meikel (above, 8), doing this is completely fine (בכורי יעקב סק"ד).

#### Maamid Demaamid

11. **Chazon Ish's opinion.** Some poskim hold that just like we are machmir lechatchilah for maamid, one must also be machmir lechatchilah for maamid demaamid, i.e., the schach's supports should also be placed on something that is kosher for schach deoraisa. This is based on Rashi's opinion that the gezeirah of maamid is that anything that is held up by something pasul is itself considered pasul (חזו"א קמ"ג). According to this, "maamid demaamid demaamid" etc. etc. is also a potential problem, and all the materials must be fit to be used for schach (שו"ע הרב ס"ג).
12. Accordingly, lechatchilah, one may not use nails to secure the wooden beams supporting the schach if the whole weight of the beams is supported by the nails since nails create a situation of maamid demaamid. Similarly, one may not place schach on walls if the walls are connected with nails, screws, or plastic zip ties and the walls would not stand without them. This is also considered maamid demaamid.
13. However, one may attach a wooden beam to a stone wall with wooden nails that can hold up the beams themselves and then add iron nails as reinforcement. Then, he can put the wooden beams that will support the schach on top of this beam.
14. **Most poskim allow it.** However, most poskim allow maamid demaamid lechatchilah. Accordingly, one may secure the schach's supports with nails, other metal pieces, or things that cannot be used as schach (שו"ע הרב, ח"י). This is the predominant minhag, especially considering that the pesul of the first maamid is only lechatchilah, not a pesul bedieved; there is certainly no need to be machmir for maamid demaamid (חזו"א סי' פ"ב, גאב"ד) unless one wants to go above and beyond and be machmir to satisfy all opinions.
15. **Holding down the schach.** One must make sure not to use something that cannot be used for schach to hold down his schach so that it does not get blown away by a normal-strength wind; this is also because of maamid [see Issue 60 (paragraphs 41 and on) in the Koveitz Chukai Chaim (first volume) for more details about this].

### Eating in the Sukkah, Brachah on the Sukkah

#### Eating a Meal vs. a Snack [Keva vs. Arai]

16. **Living in the sukkah.** The mitzvah of sukkah is that one should eat, drink, and live in the sukkah all seven days, both by day and by night, the same way one lives in his house during the rest of the year. All seven days, one should make his house secondary and his sukkah his main residence (שו"ע סי' תרל"ט ס"א).
17. Only meals must be eaten in the sukkah; strictly speaking, snacks may be eaten outside the sukkah (שו"ע שם ס"ב). Snacks are not significant enough to require eating in the sukkah since even when one lives in his house, it is common to eat snacks outside the house (מ"ב סק"ב). We will list several things that are considered snacks.

18. **Personally being machmir.** If one is personally machmir not to even drink water outside the sukkah, that is praiseworthy (שׁוֹיֵעַ שֵׁם). The same goes for less than the required amount of bread (מִיָּב סְקִי"ד) as well as other foods that, strictly speaking, may be eaten outside the sukkah, as will be explained (אִיר). Some say that the reason for this chumra is to make sure one will not end up eating a meal outside the sukkah (שׁוֹיֵעַ שׁוֹאֵל וּמְשִׁיב רְבִיעָא חִיג סִי מִיָּב). Most poskim hold that the reason is that doing this fulfills the mitzvah of sukkah in the best way, just Chazal did not make this mandatory (קוֹנְטֵרַס) (הגרי"ח הלוי, קונטרס) (הביאורים סוכה ס"ז, שנות אליהו הובא בבבא"ל ס"ב רל"ב ד"ה ואם).

#### Bread

19. Up to a kebeitzah of bread is considered a snack and may, strictly speaking, be eaten outside the sukkah. This is about 40-50 grams in modern-day terms. More than this should not be eaten outside the sukkah. To say the brachah of Leisheiv Basukkah when eating bread, one must eat more than two modern-day kebeitzim – about 90-100 grams (שיעורין של תורה שיעורי המצוות אות כ"א וכ"ז).

20. **Longer than kedei achilas pras.** The poskim argue whether one may eat more than a kebeitzah of bread outside the sukkah if he takes longer than kedei achilas pras to eat it. Some say that as long as one makes sure to take longer than kedei achilas pras, e.g., a kebeitzah spread over ten minutes, it is considered a snack that may be eaten outside the sukkah (בכורי יעקב סק"ג, שיעורי תורה ס"ג סק"ט).

21. Others say that taking longer than kedei achilas pras does not allow it to be eaten outside the sukkah since one does not eat such a quantity of bread outside his house even if he will take longer than kedei achilas pras to eat it (מקראי קודש סוכות ח"א ס"א ל"א). These poskim also hold that when one eats an amount of food that requires the brachah of Leisheiv, he may say the brachah even if it takes him longer than kedei achilas pras (חוט שני סוכות) (עמל רמ"ה). On the first night of Sukkos though, one must eat the first kezayis within kedei achilas pras (מ"ב תרל"ט סק"ב) – two minutes lechumra (שיעורין של תורה).

#### Mezonos

22. **Cooked mezonos.** Cooked foods made from the five grains, e.g., pasta, couscous, lokshen kugel, and the like, must be eaten in the sukkah when eaten as a meal (שׁוֹיֵעַ שֵׁם סִיב), i.e., when eaten with a group of people or in a quantity significant enough to be considered a meal (מִיָּב סְקִי"ו) – three or four kebeitzim (שם) (מ"ב סק"ט"ו) (סק"יב). Some are machmir and consider these foods like bread; accordingly, more than a kebeitzah must be eaten in the sukkah (מ"א). Therefore, one should be machmir not to eat more than a kebeitzah outside the sukkah, but Leisheiv should only be said when the cooked mezonos is eaten as a meal, as stated above (מ"ב שם).

#### Pas Haba Bekisnin

23. **Snack.** Strictly speaking, pas haba bekisnin eaten as a snack, e.g., less than a kebeitzah of cake or cookies, does not need to be eaten in the sukkah, while more than a kebeitzah does. But since this is a machlokes between the poskim, even after eating more than a kebeitzah, one should stay in the sukkah for some time afterward to be able to say Leisheiv, having in mind both the eating and the time spent which was done as "an act of dwelling" (מִיָּב סְקִי"ז). Even in this scenario, one should first say Mezonos and then Leisheiv (חוט שני) (סוכות עמל ר"ג).

24. **Kiddush, breakfast.** When eating pas haba bekisnin as a substitute for breakfast or at Kiddush on Shabbos or Yom Tov, more than a kebeitzah should not be eaten outside the sukkah whatsoever. Also, one may say Leisheiv even if he will not stay in the sukkah after eating since his circumstances render the food a meal (מ"ב שם).

#### Fruits

25. Strictly speaking, fruits may be eaten outside the sukkah (שׁוֹיֵעַ שֵׁם) even if they are eaten as a meal (רמ"א שם) since eating even a large quantity of fruits as a meal is like eating a bit of bread as a snack (מ"ב) (שם). Therefore, even if one eats a lot and stays in the sukkah afterward, he should not say Leisheiv.

26. **Shivas haminim.** Strictly speaking, even fruits from the shivas haminim, e.g., pomegranates or grapes, do not need to be eaten in the sukkah. Thus, even when they are eaten as a meal, one should not say Leisheiv. Even dates, which are nourishing (גמל ברכת דף י"ב) (ע"א), do not effect a chiyuv sukkah.

#### Meat, Cheese, Eggs, Vegetables

27. Some say that strictly speaking, meat, cheese, eggs, rice, vegetables, and the like may be eaten outside the sukkah since even in large quantities, they are not a meal in the same way that bread is (שׁוֹיֵעַ שֵׁם) (ומ"ב סק"ג). Others say that when eaten as a meal, they must be eaten

in the sukkah (מ"ב סק"ט"ו), especially nowadays when most people eat entire main meals without bread (תשובות והנהגות ח"א ס"י שעי"א). Still, since they aren't bread, one should not say Leisheiv.

#### Wine

28. **Arai.** Drinking wine is also considered aria. Thus, strictly speaking one may drink wine outside the sukkah (שׁוֹיֵעַ שֵׁם), even in a keva type of way (רמ"א ומ"ב שם).

29. **Keva.** Some poskim hold that if one drinks wine in a keva manner, i.e., with a group of people or in a large quantity, he must drink in the sukkah. However, many poskim hold that one should not say Leisheiv (מ"ב סק"ג); some poskim hold that one should say Leisheiv. Therefore, it is best to drink the wine along with some mezonos or during a meal (מ"ב שם). The same is true for other prominent beverages that are drunk in a keva manner.

30. **Havdalah.** One should say Havdalah on a cup of wine in the sukkah since all year it is done in the house, and one must live in the sukkah the way he lives in his house (מ"ב ס"י תרל"ט סק"ל). Since Leisheiv is not usually said on wine alone, some poskim hold that it shouldn't be said at Havdalah. Others hold that Leisheiv is said at Havdalah on a cup of wine (לוח א"י) since people do not say Havdalah outside and, accordingly, Havdalah is inherently keva (ש"כ פנ"ח הע' ק"ג) (הגרשז"א, ש"כ פנ"ח הע' ק"ג). Still, the minhag is to eat some mezonos right after Havdalah and stay in the sukkah for a bit in order to satisfy all opinions (הגרשז"א).

31. **Bris in a beis medrash.** When a bris is held in a beis medrash, one may say the brachah and drink the cup of wine outside the sukkah since strictly speaking, wine does not need to be drunk in the sukkah (above, 28). Still, it is best to drink less than a revi'is so it is not considered keva. It is not necessary to drink a revi'is of wine at a bris since it is not a halachah from the Gemara (ש"ת מנחת שלמה) (ח"ב ס"י נ"ח אות ל"ט).

#### Water, Other Drinks

32. Strictly speaking, one may drink water or other drinks outside the sukkah, even in large quantities (שׁוֹיֵעַ שֵׁם). Nevertheless, if one is machmir to drink even water in the sukkah – and certainly everything else we discussed – that is praiseworthy (as mentioned above, 18).

### The Brachah of Leisheiv Basukkah

#### Enactment of the Brachah

33. **Entering the sukkah.** Some Rishonim say that one should say Leisheiv every time he enters the sukkah, whether he goes there to eat, sit, or sleep (הר"ף כ"ב ע"א, רמב"ם פ"ו ה"יב).

34. **Eating.** Others say that one should only say Leisheiv before eating – the main form of dwelling in the sukkah – and that covers sleeping and all other times he enters, which are secondary to eating (ר"ת מג"א תרל"ט) (הובא בתוס' ברכות י"א: ד"ה שכבר) (סק"ז): to say the brachah only when eating a meal, as explained above.

35. **Eating before sitting in the sukkah.** Some say that it is advisable to satisfy all opinions. In other words, when one plans to stay in the sukkah for some time, he should eat more than a kebeitzah of mezonos and say Leisheiv right when he enters the sukkah, even if he is going to eat a meal later, and then he should not say Leisheiv again before his meal (מ"ב ס"י תרל"ט סקמ"ז). However, it should be pointed out that this is a good practice, but one should not refrain from sitting in the sukkah if he doesn't have or is not in the mood to eat mezonos food.

36. **Eating before sleeping.** Similarly, it is good to eat something that requires a Leisheiv before going to sleep so that the mitzvah of sleeping in the sukkah, which extends over a long time, is preceded by a brachah (תוס' ר' יהודה החסידי ברכות שם, רא"ש סוכה פ"ד ס"ג).

#### Visiting a Friend's Sukkah During a Meal

37. **Planned.** If one had in mind when he said Leisheiv that he would be leaving his sukkah during the meal and continuing in his friend's sukkah, he should not say a new brachah before continuing the meal at his friend's sukkah (מ"ב שם סקמ"ח). If someone regularly goes to his rebbe's tish, it is considered as if he had that in mind, and he should not say the brachah there.

38. **Unplanned.** If he was not originally planning to go, the poskim argue whether he should say Leisheiv again (מ"ב שם ובשע"צ). Due to the rule of "safeik brachos lehakeil," he should not say it again.

**A gut Yom Tov and  
a gut kvittel!**

To Donate:

